

INSIGHTS INTO INDIGENOUS POST-SECONDARY GRADUATES' EXPERIENCES IN THE

CANADIAN WORKFORCE









ABOUT CANADIAN COUNCIL FOR ABORIGINAL BUSINESS (CCAB)

Canadian Council for Aboriginal Business (CCAB) is committed to the full participation of Indigenous peoples in Canada's economy. As a national, non-partisan association, CCAB has a mission to promote, strengthen and enhance a prosperous Indigenous economy through the fostering of business relationships, opportunities and awareness. CCAB offers knowledge, resources and programs to its members to foster economic opportunities for Indigenous peoples and businesses across Canada.

For more information visit www.ccab.com.

CCAB RESEARCH

CCAB Research continuously strives to support Indigenous communities and companies in Canada. Their work is used to develop policies and programs for federal and provincial governments and corporate Canada. Identifying how Indigenous businesses can take part in supply chains, making meaningful connections through networking events, and developing customized business lists of relevant Indigenous companies are just a few ways CCAB Research can help unlock an organization's potential. The goal is to assist in fostering meaningful relationships with Indigenous peoples, businesses, and communities for organizations.



ABOUT INDSPIRE

Indspire is an Indigenous national charity that invests in the education of First Nations, Inuit and Métis people for the long-term benefit of these individuals, their families and communities, and Canada. With the support of its funding partners, Indspire provides financial awards, delivers programs and shares resources so that First Nations, Inuit, and Métis students will achieve their highest potential. Anchored by its mission and mandate, Indspire's North Star vision is that, within a generation, every Indigenous student will graduate. In 2019-2020, Indspire provided over \$17.8 million through 5,124 bursaries and scholarships to First Nations, Inuit and Métis students across Canada.

For more information, visit indspire.ca.

INDSPIRE RESEARCH KNOWLEDGE NEST

Indspire's Research Knowledge Nest is the first Indigenous research program of its kind developed here in Canada. Its mission is two-fold: to improve Indigenous educational attainment, labour market outcomes and community prosperity through ground-breaking Indigenous research; and to hire, train, and support the next generation of Indigenous researchers. Through the Research Nest, Indigenous post-secondary students and recent grads will receive hands-on training to leverage Indspire's data holdings to answer pressing education and labour market questions currently facing First Nations, Inuit and Métis (FNIM) communities. The Research Nest is funded by Founding Supporter the Suncor Energy Foundation and through the Government of Canada under the Skills and Partnership Fund.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| 1. Executive Summary | 1 |
|--|----|
| 2. Background and Report Overview | 5 |
| 3. Methodology and Approach | 7 |
| 4. Overview: Indigenous Business, Entrepreneurship and Education | 10 |
| 4.1 Indigenous Self-Employment in Ontario and Among BBF Recipients | 11 |
| 4.2 Indigenous Employers in Ontario and Among BBF Recipients | 14 |
| 5. Post-Secondary and Labour Market Experiences | 16 |
| 5.1 Employment and Education Experiences | 17 |
| 5.2 Distribution by Geography | 21 |
| 5.3 Distribution by Income | 22 |
| 6. Conclusion | 23 |
| 7. Appendix | 27 |
| Appendix A: Building Brighter Futures: Bursaries, Scholarships, and Awards | 28 |
| Appendix B: Additional Methodological Details | 28 |
| Appendix C: Indspire National Education Survey Likert Scale Questions and Factor Analysis | 29 |



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INDIGENOUS ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND EMPLOYMENT AT INDIGENOUS BUSINESSES INSIGHTS INTO EMPLOYMENT AND POST-SECONDARY STUDENTS' EXPERIENCES The Canadian Council for Aboriginal Business (CCAB) and Indspire are undertaking an exciting research collaboration and entering the next phase in their long-standing relationship. These two Indigenous organizations with national mandates have partnered to analyze their data and uncover key insights contributing to our collective understanding of educational and socio-economic outcomes of Indigenous peoples in Canada. CCAB and Indspire's research collaboration provides an opportunity to gain insights that can not only shed light on important findings related to Indigenous students in the workplace today, but can also enable employers, business leaders, and post-secondary institutions to better understand how to meet the needs of new generations of Indigenous youth.

The objective of this report is to develop a better understanding of how Indigenous post-secondary experiences are associated with entrepreneurship, working for Indigenous employers and overall labour market outcomes. The number and characteristics of Aboriginal entrepreneurs and small businesses are not widely available" (CCAB, 2016), and "accurately portraying which industries Indigenous employers operate in continues to be obscured by a lack of information" (Conference Board of Canada, 2017). Statistics pertaining to this research topic are not widely available from federal or provincial data sources. In order to explore these relationships, we retrieved and analyzed data from Indspire's 2020 National Education Survey (NES) of Building Brighter Futures: Bursaries, Scholarships, and Awards (BBF) recipients, as well as Statistics Canada's Census of Population (2016).

Using data from the NES survey, we review the characteristics of BBF recipients who go on to be employed by Indigenous employers, that is, Indigenous businesses, organizations and governments, and those who go on to self-employment. We present key findings relating to their post-secondary and employment experiences, as well as differences between self-employed BBF recipients and those employed by Indigenous and non-Indigenous employers. Additionally, we use survey data to determine the geographic outcomes of BBF recipients — whether they were required to relocate for work, and if they work in an Indigenous community.

Our primary finding is that BBF recipients who work for Indigenous employers in Ontario report being more satisfied with their current employment than those working with non-Indigenous employers. Specifically, we summarize BBF recipients' perceptions of their current employment along a number of dimensions. We have found that BBF recipients felt more strongly that they are valued at work, have a good work-life balance and are satisfied with their current employment (Figure E1A). We have also found that their employment has a greater perceived impact on Indigenous communities while working for Indigenous employers (Figure E1B).

We explore other aspects of employment with Indigenous employers that might be correlated with work satisfaction. BBF recipients who work for Indigenous employers report comparable incomes to those who do not work for Indigenous employers, suggesting that higher satisfaction with work does not come at the expense of lower annual incomes. Median income for BBF recipients is the same across Indigenous and non-Indigenous employers in this sample, but Indigenous employers are more narrowly distributed around the median.

FIGURES E1A AND E1B:

Perceived BBF Employment Experiences by Employer Type



E1A. Positive Employment Experiences

E1B. Employment Impacts Community

Note: Figure E1A presents the degree to which BBF recipients agree with the following statements: "I am satisfied with my current employment."; "On average, I am working the number of hours I desire per week."; "I feel valued at work."; and "My work provides me with a good work-life balance." Figure E1B presents the degree to which BBF recipients agree with the following statement: "My work impacts the Indigenous community."



Overall, the distribution of BBF recipients across industries does not vary substantially by employer type. In other words, those working for Indigenous employers and non-Indigenous employers are working in similar industries. This fact suggests that the observed differences in employment experiences are less likely to be driven by the types of occupations available in the industry in which individuals are employed, and they are more likely to be driven by other aspects of the employment arrangement. Top employment industries for BBF recipients include health care and social assistance; professional, scientific and technical services; arts, entertainment and recreation; educational services; and mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction. These five industries employ just over 75 per cent of BBF recipients working for Indigenous employers and just over 79 per cent of BBF recipients working for non-Indigenous employers.

Last, we find that, compared to other Indigenous workers of a similar age in Ontario, BBF recipients have a higher self-employment rate (7.61 per cent, compared to 4.86 per cent). Further, self-employed BBF recipients work primarily in five industries: health care and social assistance; arts, entertainment and recreation; educational services; construction; and real estate industries. In comparison, less than half of other self-employed Indigenous people of a similar age work in these industries.

The importance of the report's primary finding – that BBF recipients who work for Indigenous employers in Ontario report more satisfaction than those working for non-Indigenous employers – cannot be overstated. This report marks the first step in leveraging CCAB and Indspire's collective data to better understand post-graduation socio-economic outcomes for Indigenous youth – and their communities – in Canada.





INDIGENOUS ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND EMPLOYMENT AT INDIGENOUS BUSINESSES INSIGHTS INTO EMPLOYMENT AND POST-SECONDARY STUDENTS' EXPERIENCES



Indspire is a national Indigenous registered charity that invests in the education of Indigenous people for the long-term benefit of those individuals, their families and communities, and Canada.

Building Brighter Futures: Bursaries, Scholarships, and Awards program provides financial support to assist Indigenous postsecondary students in completing their education. Since 2004, Indspire has supported more than 37,500 First Nations, Inuit and Métis students and disbursed more than \$115 million in financial support (Indspire, 2019). Two key labour market– related objectives of the BBF program (see Appendix A) include increasing the number of Canadian Indigenous graduates and increasing the number of Indigenous people participating in the economy and workforce through education (Indspire, 2016).

The Canadian Council for Aboriginal Business's mission is to foster sustainable business relations between Indigenous people and Canadian businesses. This includes producing research to support the growth and enhance the opportunities for Indigenous businesses and entrepreneurs.

Both CCAB and Indspire are invested in identifying ways to support Indigenous educational, business, and labour market success. This report marks the second research collaboration between CCAB and Indspire. We investigate the post-secondary and labour market experiences of Indigenous graduates who have participated in Indspire's BBF Program using new data and past research from CCAB and Indspire to better understand how Indigenous labour market experiences differ across employment types.

The report starts with an overview of the methodology and approach. We then summarize the industries in which selfemployed and employed BBF recipients and BBF recipients who go on to be employed by Indigenous and non-Indigenous employers work. Next, we compare survey results relating to the labour market, post-secondary education and BBF program experiences of BBF recipients across employment types in Ontario. Additionally, we examine how the geographic distribution of BBF recipients varies given self-employment, compared to an Indigenous or non-Indigenous employer. Finally, we review the income distribution of BBF recipients in various employment types.

Better understanding Indigenous entrepreneurship, businesses, and post-secondary students' experiences is an important step to enhancing the social and economic well-being of Indigenous peoples. Through continuing to collect new data and undertake research, together, Indspire and CCAB are positioned to strengthen our collective understanding of the successes, challenges, and policy changes needed to enhance the prosperity of Indigenous peoples and Canada.

METHODOLOGY AND APPROACH

INDIGENOUS ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND EMPLOYMENT AT INDIGENOUS BUSINESSES INSIGHTS INTO EMPLOYMENT AND POST-SECONDARY STUDENTS' EXPERIENCES

3



In order to explore the relationship between self-employment, employment in an Indigenous business, organization or government and the educational and employment experiences, we retrieved and analyzed data from Indspire's 2020 *National Education Survey* (NES) of *Building Brighter Futures: Bursaries, Scholarships, and Awards* recipients and Statistics Canada's Census of Population (2016).

The NES was administered to the 14,185 individuals who had received BBF funding between 2013 and 2019, and we had a response rate of 46.5 per cent. Using NES data, we first identified relevant BBF recipient samples to determine individuals who are either self-employed or work for an Indigenous employer. We then constructed weights to correct for non-response and ensure our results reflect the characteristics of the full population of BBF recipients. We then compared the distribution of self-employed BBF recipients and BBF recipients who go on to work for Indigenous businesses, governments and organizations to other BBF recipients and comparable Indigenous populations in Canada.

Second, we compare the employment and education experiences of BBF recipients who go on to be self-employed or employed by Indigenous businesses, organizations and governments with the employment experiences of other BBF recipients. Additional details on the methodology, including data sources and weighting approach, can be found in Appendix B.

Examining the differences in the labour market outcomes and experiences of different groups of BBF recipients is a useful approach to delineating the experience and impact of working for an Indigenous employer or the experience of being an entrepreneur, because of the screening and selection process into the BBF program itself.

The BBF program screens its applicants on a number of criteria, including the degree to which applicants are involved in and give back to their community (Indspire, 2016). As such, we can think of our sample as a group that are already predisposed to being engaged and involved in the community. They reasonably share similar innate characteristics that might motivate an individual to likewise self-select into becoming an engaged employee or into employment that impacts Indigenous communities. Observing differences among BBF recipients, in effect, controls for that unobserved set of characteristics, making the differences we observe between those who go on to be employed, for instance, by Indigenous employers, more likely to be correlated with their experience at the job itself, rather than a function of their self-selection into that career path.

The report begins with an overview of Indigenous business, entrepreneurship and education in Canada and Ontario, including making comparisons between industry distribution of BBF recipients relative to the Indigenous labour force. We then summarize the key research findings, identify and provide concluding remarks, including opportunities for more research.

Appendix A provides additional details on Indspire and the BBF program. Appendix B provides additional details on the data used and methodological approach. Appendix C includes supplementary charts and figures from our analysis.

Previous research on education and employment in Canada documents significant and long-standing gaps between outcomes for Indigenous individuals and their non-Indigenous counterparts concerning educational attainment, income and unemployment rates (Calver, 2015). While in recent years there has been incremental improvement (Calver, 2015), fully closing these gaps will lead not only to direct economic benefits in the form of higher incomes in Indigenous communities, but also to improvements in social and cultural development indicators.

Entrepreneurship in Indigenous communities across Canada plays an important role in fostering the economic development required "to improve quality of life and build a bright future for their community members" (CCAB, 2016). Currently, "more than one in three Aboriginal businesses (36%) create employment for others" (CCAB, 2016). However, these same businesses find that "attracting qualified employees continues to be a challenge and an impediment to growth: two-thirds of employer firms say it is difficult to find Aboriginal employees, a problem that is particularly widespread among larger firms" (CCAB, 2016).

Identified as top barriers to growth for Indigenous business owners in Canada, recruiting skilled employees and overall economic conditions could be addressed with investment in skills training for Indigenous people, expanding the Indigenous skilled labour force (CCAB, 2016).

Additionally, as illustrated in this report, Indigenous graduates who go on to work with an Indigenous employer are more satisfied with their careers. This evidence suggests that overcoming the aforementioned challenge Indigenous businesses face by expanding the pool of qualified Indigenous employees could have more far-reaching benefits for communities than increased employment, economic output, and related economic spinoffs and benefits, namely, it could lead to a more satisfied, engaged and balanced workforce.



OVERVIEW: INDIGENOUS BUSINESS, ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND EDUCATION

INDIGENOUS ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND EMPLOYMENT AT INDIGENOUS BUSINESSES INSIGHTS INTO EMPLOYMENT AND POST-SECONDARY STUDENTS' EXPERIENCES

4.1 INDIGENOUS SELF-EMPLOYMENT IN ONTARIO AND AMONG BBF RECIPIENTS

Table 1 presents Indigenous self-employment¹ rates by province and territory in 2015 and illustrates that Ontario accounts for the largest proportion (23.46 per cent) of Canada's self-employed Indigenous workers. Within Ontario, 7.66 per cent of the Indigenous working population is self-employed, slightly above the median rate of 7.20 per cent across Canadian provinces and territories.

| Province or Territory | Self-Employment Rate (all ages) | Per cent of Total Self-Employed |
|-----------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Ontario | 7.66% | 23.46% |
| British Columbia | 9.46% | 20.75% |
| Alberta | 8.39% | 16.70% |
| Quebec | 10.25% | 15.13% |
| Manitoba | 5.83% | 8.69% |
| Atlantic Provinces | 6.74% | 6.80% |
| Saskatchewan | 6.20% | 6.72% |
| Northwest Territories | 4.21% | 0.67% |
| Yukon | 7.89% | 0.54% |
| Nunavut | 3.03% | 0.54% |
| Canada | 7.20% (Median) | 100% |

Table 1: Indigenous Self-Employment Rates by Province and Territory

Source: Statistics Canada Custom Tabulation, 2016 Census (2018), authors' own calculations.

Indigenous workers who are self-employed in Ontario are distributed differently across different industries than the general population of employed Indigenous workers. Table 2 presents the top five industries, using the North American Industry Classification System (NAICS), that comprise the largest share of self-employed workers, relative to the population of all Indigenous workers.

In Ontario, 60.45 per cent of self-employed workers are in construction (18.49 per cent), professional, scientific and technical services (11.99 per cent), other services (except public administration) (10.76 per cent), health care and social assistance (9.69 per cent), and administrative and support, waste management and remediation services (9.52 per cent). Comparatively, 33.66 per cent of employed Indigenous people work in these same industries.

¹ Self-employed individuals are defined as "working owners of an incorporated business, farm or professional practice, or working owners of an unincorporated business, farm or professional practice. The latter group also includes self-employed workers who do not own a business" (Statistics Canada, 2015).

| Industry NAICS | Self-Employed (all ages) | Employed (all ages) |
|---|-----------------------------|------------------------|
| Construction | 18.49% | 6.94% |
| Professional, scientific and technical services | 11.99% | 3.37% |
| Other services (except public administration) | 10.76% | 3.74% |
| Health care and social assistance | 9.69% | 14.78% |
| Administrative and support, waste management and remediation services | 9.52% | 4.83% |
| Total | 60.45% | 33.66% |

Table 2: Top 5 Industries for Indigenous Self-Employment versus Employment in Ontario by NAICS

Source: Statistics Canada Custom Tabulation, 2016 Census (2018), authors' own calculations.

BBF recipients who go on to self-employment are concentrated in different industries, compared to the self-employed Indigenous population of a similar age. Table 3 shows that BBF recipients who go on to self-employment are primarily employed in only five industries: health care and social assistance (45 per cent); arts, entertainment and recreation (25 per cent); educational services (13.75 per cent); professional, scientific and technical services (6.25 per cent); and construction (five per cent). In total, these five industries employ 95 per cent of BBF recipients who go on to self-employment. Comparatively, less than half (48.81 per cent) of age-adjusted self-employed Indigenous people work in these industries.



Table 3: Top 5 Industries of Self-Employed Former BBF Recipients and Age-Adjusted Self-Employed Indigenous Workers in Canada by NAICS

| Industry NAICS | Self-Employed (all BBF recipients) | Self-Employed (age-adjusted) |
|---|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Health care and social assistance | 45 % | 11.49% |
| Arts, entertainment and recreation | 25% | 5.16% |
| Educational services | 13.75% | 1.91% |
| Professional, scientific and technical services | 6.25% | 10.42% |
| Construction | 5% | 19.83% |
| Total | 95% | 48.81% |

Source: Statistics Canada Custom Tabulation, 2016 Census (2018), authors' own calculations; Indspire 2020 National Education Survey (NES), authors' own calculations. The age-adjusted column is derived by weighting self-employment rates to the same population distribution as the NES sample. This corrects for the proportionally higher rates of self-employment among an older demographic.

It is reasonable to assume that BBF recipients who go on to become self-employed would share characteristics that differ from other Indigenous people of the same age. For instance, self-employment rates are higher among BBF recipients than Indigenous self-employed individuals in their equivalent age cohort in Ontario. Of former BBF recipients who are employed, 7.61 per cent are self-employed, compared with 4.86 per cent of other Indigenous people of a similar age.

Although not the focus of this paper, understanding the socio-demographic characteristics and educational paths of BBF recipients who go on to self-employment relative to the Indigenous workforce can provide insights into what characteristics are associated with higher rates of entrepreneurship among Indigenous graduates.

4.2 INDIGENOUS EMPLOYERS IN ONTARIO AND AMONG BBF RECIPIENTS

Although self-employment rates offer some insights into the prevalence and representation across industries of Indigenous employers, data on the "number and characteristics of Aboriginal entrepreneurs and small businesses are not widely available" (CCAB, 2016), and "accurately portraying which industries Indigenous employers operate in continues to be obscured by a lack of information" (Conference Board of Canada, 2017).

By combining Canada Business Patterns (CBP) data with selected Indigenous communities, the National Aboriginal Capital Corporations Association estimated that "there are over 10,000 businesses located on-reserve" (Conference Board of Canada, 2017). Excluding public service industries (for example, public administration, health care and education), the CBP data suggests "the sectors with the highest proportion of [Indigenous] businesses with employees are retail trade (69%); accommodation and food services (63%); wholesale trade (55%); and manufacturing (52%)" (Conference Board of Canada, 2017).

Approximately 35 per cent of the respondents report working for an Indigenous employer. Table 4 illustrates the top five industries in which Indigenous-employed BBF recipients across Canada are working. The top five industries in the private sector account for just over 72 per cent of BBF recipient employees, while for all Indigenous employers these industries account for just over 75 per cent. BBF recipients employed in the private sector are more broadly spread across the top five industries, while those with non-private sector employers are heavily concentrated in health care and social assistance, and educational services.

| BBF Employer | Indigenous | | Non-Indigenous |
|---|----------------|--------------|----------------|
| Industry (NAICS) | Private Sector | All Employed | All Employed |
| Health care and social assistance | 20% | 32.91% | 37.86% |
| Professional, scientific and technical services | 16.92% | 5.10% | 6.04% |
| Arts, entertainment and recreation | 15.38% | 5.61% | 5.33% |
| Educational services | 12.31% | 30.36% | 26.92% |
| Mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction | 7.69% | 1.53% | 3.05% |
| Total | 72.30% | 75.51% | 79.20% |

Table 4: Top 5 Industries of BBF Employment by Sector* and Employer Type, Canada

Source: Indspire 2020 National Education Survey, authors' own calculations.

(*) Private sector excludes respondents who self-identified as working for a government or public organization.

Table 4 also shows the distribution of BBF recipients by non-Indigenous employers. The top five industries employ 79.20 per cent of all BBF recipients working for non-Indigenous employers. This suggests that BBF recipients' industry of employment is more likely to reflect the education and training they have received than the structure of the Indigenous employers' sector. The similarity in distribution across industries provides additional support for the validity of our approach to comparing the labour market and employment experiences of BBF recipients employed by non-Indigenous and Indigenous people.



POST-SECONDARY AND LABOUR MARKET EXPERIENCES

BBF recipients differ in their labour market characteristics and outcomes from the general population of Indigenous workers of similar ages. Many individuals responding to the NES shared the impact this award had on their educational experience, their ability to complete their program and their capacity to find future employment upon graduation. Given the impact Indspire's programming has on individuals' educational experience and its focus on supporting post-secondary education, it is reasonable to expect these individuals to have different labour market characteristics than the population of Indigenous workers in Ontario and across Canada.

As such, we examine the difference in labour market and post-secondary experiences among BBF recipients working in Ontario, in order to compare how these experiences differed for individuals who go on to be self-employed or who go on to work for Indigenous employers.

We first look at the experiences of self-employed individuals and of individuals currently working for Indigenous employers and how the BBF award shaped their education experience. We compare whether self-employment and employment with Indigenous employers is more or less likely to require relocation for work or to be undertaken in Indigenous communities. Last, we compare the income distribution across BBF recipients' employment types.

5.1 EMPLOYMENT AND EDUCATION EXPERIENCES

As part of the NES, BBF recipients were asked 18 Likert scale statement-and-response-type questions, 12 of which were related to four general themes. Likert scale questions are used to represent people's perceptions on a topic. Figures 1A–H present summaries of the degree to which BBF recipients strongly agreed to strongly disagreed with the following statements:

1. Positive Employment Experiences:

- I am satisfied with my current employment.
- On average, I am working the number of hours I desire per week.
- I feel valued at work.
- My work provides me with a good work-life balance.

2. Positive Transition from Education to Labour Market:

- My education prepared me for the job market.
- I am employed in a role that makes use of my education.
- 3. Employment Impacts Community:
 - My work impacts the Indigenous community.
- 4. Positive Award Impact on Education and Well-Being:
 - The award allowed me to spend more time focused on my studies.
 - The award allowed me to spend more time with friends and family.
 - The award allowed me to spend more time in the Indigenous community.
 - The award allowed me to spend more time on volunteer activities.
 - Without the award, I could not have completed my studies.

Responses to Likert scale questions were gauged on a five-part scale, from "strongly disagree" to "strongly agree." Figures 1A–H present summaries of the differences across respondents who go on to be employed by Indigenous employers or who go on to self-employment. We calculate the average answer across respondent types to Likert scale statements under a common theme. In this way, we can interpret a higher bar as representing more individuals who more strongly agree with positive statements about their experience related to a particular theme. Appendix C provides additional details on Likert scale questions and analysis.



Overall, BBF recipients in Ontario overwhelmingly report positive labour market, education and employment experiences. On average, BBF recipients also felt the program award positively affected their educational experiences; allowed them more time to study, volunteer and be with family; and supported their capacity to complete the program.

Although NES respondents are similar on these experiential dimensions across many co-variates, there are a number of specific differences with respect to the employment experiences of BBF recipients employed by Indigenous versus non-Indigenous employers that are worth noting.

Ontario BBF recipients working for Indigenous employers report being more satisfied with their current job (see Figure 1A). Namely, individuals employed by Indigenous employers, on average, more strongly agree that they feel valued at work, are satisfied with their current employment, that they work the desired number of hours and that their work enables them to have a positive work-life balance. This is striking given BBF recipients are employed in similar industries (as discussed in Section 4).

BBF recipients working for Indigenous employers report having similarly positive education and labour market experiences, that is, they feel their current role makes use of their education and that their education has prepared them for the labour force (see Figure 1C). This aligns with our findings in Section 4, suggesting BBF recipients are employed in similar industries, regardless of their employer type.

Additionally, individuals employed by Indigenous employers more strongly agree that their work impacts Indigenous communities (see Figure 1E).

The labour market and employment experiences of BBF recipients who go on to be self-employed are similar to those who go on to be employed by others across most dimensions (Figures 1B, 1D and 1F). Interestingly, individuals who report going on to self-employment report that the BBF program had a higher impact on their post-secondary experiences. Many recipients shared the positive ways the BBF program affected their lives and careers (Figure 1H). At least one recipient highlighted that the program allowed them to have enough income "to survive with just selling [their] artwork," suggesting a relationship between access to post-secondary funding and future self-employment.

Last, to aid in understanding the large number of questions relating to each broad theme, we applied a factor analysis on all 18 Likert-style questions asked in the NES to produce summary dimensions and to test the validity of our survey. Details on the weighted statements that comprise this summary analysis can be found in Appendix C. Overall, our analysis provides evidence of internal consistency across respondents, suggesting the survey captures the intended topics well.

Figure 1: (A–D) Educational and Labour Market Experiences, BBF Recipients by Employment Type, Ontario



POSITIVE EMPLOYMENT EXPERIENCES BY

POSITIVE TRANSITION FROM EDUCATION TO LABOUR MARKET BY



C. Employer Type



D. Employment Type



Source: Indspire 2020 National Education Survey, authors' own calculations.







F. Employment Type

POSITIVE AWARD IMPACT ON EDUCATION AND WELL-BEING BY



G. Employer Type



H. Employment Type



Source: Indspire 2020 National Education Survey, authors' own calculations.

5.2 DISTRIBUTION BY GEOGRAPHY

Given the differences in employment experiences of individuals who go on to work for Indigenous employers in Ontario, this report investigates other components of their employment experiences that may be related to their overall satisfaction at work.

The majority (58 per cent) of employed BBF recipients were not required to relocate for work (see Table 5). Recipients employed by Indigenous employers were less likely to need to relocate for work than other employed BBF recipients, with 67 per cent of individuals finding employment where they reside.

Table 5: Requirement to Relocate for Work by Employer Type, Ontario

| BBF Recipients | Yes | No |
|---------------------|-----|-----|
| Total Employed | 41% | 58% |
| Indigenous Employer | 33% | 67% |
| Self-Employed | 36% | 64% |

Source: Indspire 2020 National Education Survey, authors' own calculations.

Similarly, individuals who go on to be self-employed are less likely than other BBF recipients to have to relocate, with 64 per cent of recipients not required to relocate to start their business (see Table 5).

The likelihood of being employed in an Indigenous community likewise varies between employer type. In the total employed sample, 37 per cent worked in Indigenous communities. We found that the proportion of Indigenous-employed BBF recipients working in an Indigenous community is 75 per cent, considerably higher than the proportion working who are self-employed (28 per cent) (see Table 6).

Table 6: Location of Work in Indigenous Community* by Employer Type, Ontario

| BBF Recipients | Yes | No |
|---------------------|-----|-----|
| Total Employed | 37% | 63% |
| Indigenous Employer | 75% | 25% |
| Self-Employed | 28% | 72% |

Source: Indspire 2020 National Education Survey, authors' own calculations.

(*) Indigenous community is defined as "on a First Nations reserve," "within a Métis settlement," "within an Inuit settlement" or "in another kind of Indigenous community."

5.3 DISTRIBUTION BY INCOME

Last, we consider whether employment by Indigenous employers is associated with different income attainment among other types of BBF recipients in Ontario.

The income distribution of BBF recipients employed by Indigenous and non-Indigenous employers across Canada is illustrated in Figure 2. The median income of \$55,000 per annum is the same for Indigenous and non-Indigenous employers in this sample. The income distribution for Indigenous employers is more tightly concentrated around the median, that is, non-Indigenous employers are more likely to pay BBF recipients between \$10,000 and \$29,999 per annum at the low end of the income distribution scale and more than \$80,000 at the high end of the scale. This suggests that satisfaction in employment with Indigenous employers does not come at the expense of comparable pay rates.



Figure 2: Income of BBF Recipients Employed by Non-Indigenous vs Indigenous Employers

Figure 2 includes employers across all sectors, that is, public, non-profit and private. We find that self-employed individuals have a lower median income of \$42,500 annually. This result is driven by a large proportion of individuals making less than \$20,000 per year, all of whom are employed in the arts, entertainment and recreation industries. Additionally, it is reasonable to expect lower annual incomes for younger self-employed individuals, as the returns to their business may be higher later in their careers.

CONCLUSION

INDIGENOUS ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND EMPLOYMENT AT INDIGENOUS BUSINESSES INSIGHTS INTO EMPLOYMENT AND POST-SECONDARY STUDENTS' EXPERIENCES



This report summarizes findings of Indspire's 2020 National Education Survey and relies on CCAB Indigenous business data to investigate the post-secondary and labour market experiences of BBF recipients.

We find BBF recipients are more likely to be self-employed than Indigenous workers in the same age cohort. Additionally, we find that self-employed BBF recipients are more concentrated in the health care and social assistance, educational services, construction, and real estate rental and leasing industries than the broader Indigenous population.

Approximately 35 per cent of BBF recipients report working for an Indigenous employer. Given data limitations, we cannot compare this statistic with the proportion of Indigenous employees working for Indigenous employers in the labour force more broadly (that is, beyond NES respondents). We find that the majority (72.30 per cent) of BBF recipients working for private sector Indigenous employers are more broadly dispersed by industry type than those working for non-private sector Indigenous employers, who are predominantly employed in the health care and social assistance and educational services industries.

Finally, we go on to analyze the outcomes of employed and self-employed BBF recipients by experience, geography and income. Significantly, we find BBF recipients working for Indigenous employers felt they were satisfied with their current career, felt valued at work, have a good work-life balance and that their work affects the Indigenous community. The general satisfaction that Indigenous-employed BBF recipients feel with their jobs could be an explanation for the fact that, although "Aboriginal business owners with employees report that they face challenges finding qualified Aboriginal employees ... once they are hired, it is easier to retain them" (CCAB, 2016).

We then explore other characteristics of employment with Indigenous employers. Geographically, BBF recipients with an Indigenous employer were less likely to relocate for work and more likely to work in an Indigenous community than those employed by non-Indigenous employers. We find median employment income for employed BBF recipients is the same for Indigenous and non-Indigenous employers in this sample for all employment sectors, suggesting that higher satisfaction rates are not coming at the expense of higher wages.

This report marks the second research collaboration between CCAB and Indspire. Currently, there is a lack of data on Indigenous entrepreneurship and educational success, limiting our understanding of how best to mobilize in support of Indigenous wellbeing. In this report, CCAB and Indspire are starting to address this data gap and are uniquely well positioned to continue to collect and analyze additional data to inform joint research projects. Through leveraging our data and respective mandates, we can continue to produce new research aimed at shaping stakeholders' and governments' actions to better support the educational success, and ultimately, the economic and social well-being of Indigenous peoples. We all have roles to play in ensuring Indigenous students have the supports they need to be successful in school, and that the education that students attain sets them, their communities, and Canada on the course for prosperity. By continuing to work together through research like this, CCAB and Indspire can help inform how to make this vision into a reality.



REFERENCES

Calver, M. (2015). Centre for the Study of Living Standards (CSLS). Closing the Aboriginal Education Gap in Canada: Assessing Progress and Estimating the Economic Benefits. Retrieved from the CSLS website: http://www.csls.ca/reports/csls2015-03.pdf

Canadian Council for Aboriginal Business (CCAB). (2016). Promise and Prosperity: The 2016 Aboriginal Business Survey. Retrieved from the CCAB website: https://www.ccab.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/10/CCAB-PP-Report-V2-SQ-Pages.pdf

Conference Board of Canada. (2017). Aboriginal entrepreneurship in Canada. Prepared for National Aboriginal Capital Corporations Association (NACCA) and Business Development Bank of Canada (BDC). Retrieved from the National Aboriginal Capital Corporations Association website: https://nacca.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/Research-Module-1_NACCA-BDC_ Feb14_2017.pdf

Government of Canada. (2020). Find your NOC. Retrieved from the Government of Canada website: https://www.canada. ca/en/immigration-refugees-citizenship/services/immigrate-canada/express-entry/eligibility/find-national-occupation-code. html

Indspire. (2019). Bursaries & Scholarships. Retrieved from: https://indspire.ca/programs/students/bursaries-scholarships/

Indspire. (2016). Building Brighter Futures: Bursaries, Scholarships, And Awards — Application Guide. Retrieved from the Indspire website: https://indspire.ca/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/indspire-building-brighter-futures-guidelines-2016-2017-en-June-14.pdf

Indspire. (2014). Building Brighter Futures: Bursaries, Scholarships, And Awards — Program Policy. Retrieved from the Indspire website: https://indspire.ca/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/Approved-BBF-Policy-Sept-26-2014.pdf

Statistics Canada. (2015). Data and definitions. Retrieved from the Statistics Canada website: https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/pub/21-006-x/2012001/data-eng.htm

DATA SOURCES

Indspire. (2020). National Education Survey. Retrieved from Indspire.

Statistics Canada. (2018). Custom tabulation, 2016 Census. Retrieved from the Statistics Canada website: https://www75. statcan.gc.ca/eft-tef/en/login-connexion

APPENDIX

INDIGENOUS ENTREPRENEURSHIP AND EMPLOYMENT AT INDIGENOUS BUSINESSES INSIGHTS INTO EMPLOYMENT AND POST-SECONDARY STUDENTS' EXPERIENCES

APPENDIX A: BUILDING BRIGHTER FUTURES: BURSARIES, SCHOLARSHIPS, AND AWARDS PROGRAM

Indspire's Building Brighter Futures: Bursaries, Scholarships, and Awards program provides financial support to assist Indigenous post-secondary students in completing their post-secondary education. Since 2004, Indspire has supported more than 37,500 First Nations, Inuit and Métis students, and it has disbursed more than \$115 million in financial support. In 2019-20, Indspire awarded \$17.8 million through over 5100 awards and scholarships...

The stated objectives of the BBF program are to:

- Support as many students as possible;
- Meet each student's financial need;
- Increase the number of Canadian Indigenous graduates;
- Increase the number of Indigenous people participating in the economy and workforce through education;
- Transform lives within Indigenous communities through education, and;
- Collect and present data about Indigenous education to support good public policy (Indspire, 2014).

Applications are reviewed by a jury of Indigenous (status and non-status) and non-Indigenous professionals from across Canada on the basis of the following assessment criteria:

- Demonstrated financial need and contribution to education costs;
- Evidence of community involvement ("Giving Back to the Community/Community Involvement" portion of the application), and;
- Demonstrated academic merit and performance (Indspire, 2016).

APPENDIX B: ADDITIONAL METHODOLOGICAL DETAILS

NES Data Collection

The 2020 National Education Survey was administered to the 14,185 individuals who received a BBF program award between the years 2013 and 2019. The response rate to the survey was 46.5 per cent, with somewhat higher participation among recipients who had received an award in more recent years.

The survey was distributed via email between February 13, 2020, and March 1, 2020. The questionnaire was designed to generate data comparable to the 2016 Census of Population, where possible, and covered topics that included:

- Education;
- Employment;
- Post-secondary and labour market experiences; and Indigenous students' needs, and;
- Information on the types of students supported.

Survey Weighting

Given survey respondents are likely to share a set of characteristics that are likewise correlated with the outcomes the analysis is trying to capture, we produced post-stratified weights to reflect the characteristics of the full population of BBF recipients. Specifically, where appropriate, we weighted participants to correct for non-response across:

- Age, by cluster (0.5 per cent);
- Gender (2.8 per cent); and
- Location, by province (4.3 per cent).

The sample showed good distribution across these and other dimensions (including Indigenous identity and program type). The median corrective factor provided in parentheses reflects how near the response was to the underlying target population.

APPENDIX C: INDSPIRE NATIONAL EDUCATION SURVEY LIKERT SCALE QUESTIONS AND FACTOR ANALYSIS

Likert scale questions were posed to individuals, asking them to agree or disagree with the following statements by topic:

1. Positive Employment Experiences:

- I am satisfied with my current employment.
- On average, I am working the number of hours I desire per week.
- I feel valued at work.
- My work provides me with a good work-life balance.

2. Positive Transition from Education to Labour Market

- My education prepared me for the job market.
- I am employed in a role that makes use of my education.

3. Employment Impacts Community:

• My work impacts the Indigenous community.

4. Barriers to Education:

- Financial constraints have been a challenge to my education.
- My mental health has been a challenge to my education.
- My physical health has been a challenge to my education.
- My interpersonal relationships have been a challenge to my education.
- The stress of meeting all of my obligations has been a challenge to my education.

5. Positive Impact of BBF Award on Education and Well-Being:

- The award allowed me to spend more time focused on my studies.
- The award allowed me to spend more time with friends and family.
- The award allowed me to spend more time in the Indigenous community.
- The award allowed me to spend more time on volunteer activities.
- Without the award, I could not have completed my studies.

To support an overall understanding of these questions, an exploratory factor analysis was conducted. To simplify the factors, a factor analysis was conducted using the full dataset of Likert scale questions, and any weights of less than 15 per cent were excluded. This produced an exhaustive mapping to three summary dimensions from the original 18 dimensions (see Figure A1).

Figure A1: Results of Analysis



Here, the (horizontal) x-axis shows the relative importance of statements within each cluster. In this case, people feel more strongly about "satisfaction with my current employment" than with other facets of their labour market and education experiences.

Overall, the resulting clusters (groupings of statements) form common topics. In other words, the interpretation of the resulting dimensions is natural and aligned with the design intent of the questions. Clusters of common topics suggest respondents are answering questions in an internally consistent way and provide evidence of reliable survey design.



2 Berkeley St #202, Toronto, ON M5A 4J5 Telephone: 416-961-8663 Fax: 416-961-3995 ccab.com



General Inquiries

Phone: 1.855.INDSPIRE (1.855.463.7747) Email: info@indspire.ca indspire.ca



Head Office

Box 5, Suite 100 50 Generations Drive Six Nations of the Grand River Ohsweken, Ontario NOA 1M0 Fax: 866.433.3159

Toronto Office

555 Richmond Street West Suite 1002 Toronto, Ontario M5V 3B1 Fax: 416.926.7554